
**SUB- STATE DIPLOMACY AS TO CONTEMPORARY
INDONESIAN DIPLOMACY:
Paradiplomacy strategy in strengthening sister city cooperation in
tourism sector**

Laode Muhamad Fathun¹, I Nyoman Aji Suadhana Rai², Vania Zahra
Nathania³, Tuhfahtu Hasanatul Wahidah⁴

UPN Veteran Jakarta/ Secretary of Indonesian City Diplomacy
Community

e-mail Laodemuhammadfathun@upnvj.ac.id,

Nyoman.rai13@gmail.com, 2210412014@mahasiswa.upnvj.ac.id,

2210412076@mahasiswa.upnvj.ac.id

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menjelaskan diplomasi sub-negara Indonesia sebagai gaya diplomasi Indonesia kontemporer untuk mencapai kepentingan nasional. Saat ini kepentingan nasional tidak hanya dijalankan secara monopoli oleh negara. Namun, aktor sub-negara juga terlibat sebagai aktor yang mendukung diplomasi Indonesia di era kontemporer. Artikel ini menggunakan metodologi kualitatif berdasarkan studi kasus. Penelitian ini menggunakan teknik pengumpulan data observasi, wawancara dan studi pustaka. Penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa kerja sama antar kawasan yaitu Australia yang diwakili New South Wales dan Indonesia yang diwakili DKI Jakarta mempunyai potensi kerja sama yang baik. Hal ini didasari oleh hubungan baik kedua negara ditambah kerja sama sister city antar kedua wilayah ibu kota untuk mendukung pelaksanaan kerja sama. Kerjasama yang dilakukan pada bidang pariwisata merupakan kerjasama dua daerah yang sangat menguntungkan dalam bidang ekonomi pariwisata. Sebab kedua wilayah tersebut merupakan wilayah yang memiliki karakter yang sama yaitu wilayah maritim. Kerja sama tersebut harus didasarkan pada kolaborasi di tingkat negara dengan menggunakan metode kebijakan luar negeri komparatif bersama. Artinya pemerintah daerah mendukung kerja sama nasional yang diwujudkan dalam bentuk kerja sama sister city.

Kata kunci : Diplomasi sub negara, paradiplomasi, New South Wales, DKI Jakarta, Pariwisata

Abstract

This research aims to explain Indonesian sub-state diplomacy as a style of contemporary Indonesian diplomacy to achieve national interests. Currently, national interests are not only carried out in a monopolistic manner by the state. However, sub-state actors are also involved as actors who support Indonesian diplomacy in the contemporary era. This article uses a qualitative methodology based on case studies. This

research uses data collection techniques of observation, interviews and literature. This research shows that cooperation between regions, namely Australia represented by New South Wales and Indonesia represented by DKI Jakarta, has the potential for good cooperation. This is based on the excellent relations between the two countries plus sister city cooperation between the two capital regions to support the implementation of cooperation. The cooperation carried out in the tourism sector is a collaboration between two regions which is very profitable in the tourism economic sector. Because both regions are areas that have the same character, namely maritime areas. This cooperation must be based on collaboration at the country level using the joint comparative foreign policy method. This means that the regional government supports national cooperation which is implemented in the form of sister city cooperation.

Key words : Sub state diplomacy, paradiplomacy, New South Wales, DKI Jakarta, Touris

INTRODUCTION

Foreign relations within the framework of regional autonomy in Indonesia are not as extensive as in other countries such as the United States, Canada, Spain, Germany, Australia, and several other regions. In Indonesia, foreign relations are neither rigid nor overly broad; they remain conservative because Indonesia is a unitary state. Consequently, while granting some autonomy to regions in foreign relations, the central government continues to act as a catalyst, facilitator, and protector in these matters. This necessitates that local governments operate through a single gateway system for foreign relations, with restrictions on issues such as religion, finance, military, monetary, and foreign policy. Nonetheless, the central government retains control over significant issues, positioning local governments as partners.

In response to these duties and responsibilities, several regions in Indonesia have established international cooperation or paradiplomacy with regions abroad, even before various regulations on foreign relations and local governance emerged. This indicates that some regions are more progressive and view themselves as important actors in global politics. One notable example is Jakarta, which has been engaged in sister city cooperation since 1971, starting with Jeddah, Saudi Arabia.

According to a report by Jakarta News in 2019, Muhammad Mawardi, the Head of the Regional Head and Foreign Cooperation Bureau of DKI Jakarta, stated that Jakarta had established sister city cooperation with 21 cities worldwide. These partner cities include Jeddah, Seoul, Islamabad, Rotterdam, Tokyo, Los Angeles, Casablanca, Beijing, Arkansas, Berlin, New South Wales, Paris, Bangkok, Hanoi, Istanbul, Maputo, Kyiv, Moscow, Jerusalem, Pyongyang, and Budapest.

This study focuses on New South Wales, a state in Australia, due to the close bilateral relationship between Indonesia and Australia in various strategic fields. Additionally, New South Wales boasts beautiful natural landscapes, making it significant to develop sister city cooperation between Jakarta and New South Wales. Despite tensions arising between the two countries following the Bali bombings and the Bali Nine tragedy, current bilateral relations are more conducive as Indonesia and Australia are strategic partners.

Therefore, this cooperation needs to be continuously enhanced, considering that Indonesia and Australia collaborate at the national level, while Jakarta and New South Wales collaborate at the sub-national level. This dual-level cooperation facilitates the realization of national interests of both countries, not only through central diplomatic channels but also through regional diplomatic channels. Essentially, while foreign relations are conducted at the national level, their implementation occurs at the sub-national level.

Given the potential for sister city cooperation in the tourism sector, both cities have significant opportunities. Jakarta offers various tourist attractions such as the Thousand Islands, Ancol Dreamland, historical sites, and zero-emission zones in the Old Town area. On the other hand, Australia, particularly New South Wales, is a favorite destination for international students and boasts attractions such as Bondi Beach, Bridge Climb, and Manly Beach. Furthermore, Sydney offers a variety of Indonesian cuisine, reflecting the close relationship between Indonesia and Australia.

This article discusses the necessity of implementing capital city cooperation between Jakarta and New South Wales, particularly in the tourism sector, to

leverage their shared tendencies. This is important because Jakarta, especially North Jakarta with the Thousand Islands, is characterized by its maritime features that need to be maximized for development. Additionally, cooperation with New South Wales, which has similar maritime potential, along with the strong bilateral relationship between Australia and Indonesia, presents economic growth opportunities that Jakarta has not yet fully utilized.

The Thousand Islands, with various tourist destinations such as Tidung Island, Pramuka Island, Pari Island, Harapan Island, and Macan Island, offer water sports, mangrove planting, snorkeling, diving, and other activities. Despite the numerous tourist destinations, the inhabitants of the Thousand Islands significantly contribute to poverty in Jakarta.

Year	Line of poverty (rupiah/capita/month)	Number of Poor People (thousand)	Percentage of Poor Population
2020	661.852	3,63	14,87
2021	670.785	3,86	15,06
2022	701.088	3,67	14,11
2023	743.820	3,47	13,13

Source: BPS, Poverty Indicators 2020-2023

Therefore, this study will discuss the opportunities and challenges of cooperation between the capital city of Jakarta and New South Wales to build a strong economic foundation. The aim is to identify and explain existing issues and propose solutions for economic development in the region.

Concept Paradiplomacy in Indonesia

Post-reformation, Indonesia underwent a significant transformation in its political and governance systems, transitioning from a centralized government to a decentralized one. This change brought both challenges and opportunities for establishing a new paradigm in sustainable development. Before the reformation era, development and governance were concentrated in the central regions, leading to unequal development across various regions of Indonesia. The archipelago,

stretching from Sabang to Merauke, experienced disproportionate development, predominantly in the western parts of Indonesia. Thus, the shift to a decentralized political system provided regions with opportunities to develop their local potential.

Before the reformation, Indonesia was divided into 27 provinces from Sabang to Merauke. However, post-reformation saw the expansion of autonomous regions into various areas, including provinces, regencies, and cities. This division began with the enactment of Law No. 25 of 2000 concerning Regional Government in 1999. Shortly after, the Ministry of Regional Autonomy was established, spearheaded by M. Ryas Rasyid as the first minister. The acceleration of local governance continued to evolve, culminating in the issuance of Law No. 32 of 2004, which further legitimized regional governance.

The refinement of policies and regulations has allowed local governance in Indonesia to continue developing to this day. Presently, Indonesia consists of 38 provinces and approximately 571 regencies and cities. Provinces are led by governors, while regencies and cities are led by regents or mayors. This governance structure led to the amendment of the Regional Autonomy Law to Law No. 23 of 2014, which remains in use today. These regulations hold the potential to increase the number of provinces, regencies, and cities in Indonesia. Furthermore, the enactment of Law No. 37 of 1999 and Law No. 20 of 2000 expanded the grandeur of regional government roles.

The enactment of these laws has also shifted the focus of academic studies in Indonesia, directing research towards the role of regions in developing their areas. Autonomy is seen as enabling regions to identify, develop, and expand their power to achieve interests aligned with national interests. However, most research still focuses on domestic studies to understand regional roles in local development. The concept of paradiplomacy, first introduced by Takdir Ali Mukti in 2013, marked the beginning of paradiplomacy studies in Indonesia. Despite paradiplomacy roles in international cooperation being initiated by Bandung in the 1960s, Mukti's work became a foundational reference for paradiplomacy studies. This sparked increased

interest among reviewers in International Relations studies to explore paradiplomacy strategies or local government roles in foreign relations.

At the international level, paradiplomacy aims to utilize services for its citizens and promote decentralization to move away from isolationist policies. The goal of paradiplomacy is to improve the welfare of its population. For effective external relations, paradiplomacy must consider five factors: objectives and motivations, level of involvement, structure and resources, degree of participation, and strategy (Tavares, 2016; Aldecoa, 2013).

This importance is underscored by the evolving international system, where international relations actors become increasingly complex. This aligns with Keohane's theory of complex interdependence, which demands state actors to adapt. Soldatos (1990) highlighted that paradiplomacy should leverage four segmentations: objective segmentation regarding cultural, linguistic, religious, and geographical characteristics; perception segmentation regarding loyalty, perceptions, concepts, and attitudes; policy segmentation regarding external relations strategies; and actor segmentation regarding collaboration and communication. Further, Keating identified three patterns in formulating central and regional relations: top-down (initiated by the center and supported by regions), bottom-up (initiated by regions demanding international action and collaboration), and collaborative strategies or actions. Traditional program approaches include five components: initiation, planning and design, implementation and construction, monitoring and control systems, and completion (Aldecoa, 2013).

As actors in foreign relations, paradiplomacy seeks to foster inter-regional cooperation following Law No. 23 of 2014, which states:

"cooperation between provincial, regency/city governments and foreign parties, including cooperation between provinces, sister cities, technical cooperation covering humanitarian assistance, forwarding loans/grants, capital participation cooperation, and other cooperation in accordance with legislative regulations" (Law No. 23 of 2014).

"Regional Cooperation is a joint effort between regions with other regions, between regions with third parties, and/or between regions and institutions or local governments abroad based on efficiency and effectiveness considerations of public services and mutual benefits." (Government Regulation No. 28/2018 on Regional Cooperation).

Entering the contemporary era of foreign relations is influenced by globalization and increasingly complex interactions among actors. Regional leadership must excel not only locally but also regionally and internationally. If effectively utilized by city, regency, and provincial governments in Indonesia, this will positively portray Indonesia as a nation with good governance, showcasing advanced, creative, competitive, and progressive cities. Therefore, local governments must adopt an outward-looking perspective and be prepared to compete globally.

The paradigm of paradiplomacy to achieve its interests is limited, prompting Soldatos (1990) to propose four formulations: cooperative joint coordinator where the government is the dominant actor in foreign relations, cooperative joint formula, parallel harmony, and parallel disharmony. Paradiplomacy as an international relations actor involves several types of engagement, including cross-border regional paradiplomacy, transregional paradiplomacy, and global paradiplomacy. To be competitive, paradiplomacy must consider factors such as globalization, regionalism, democratization, the domestication of foreign policy, internationalization of domestic interests, federalization and decentralization, nation-building processes, the central government's role in external relations, the role of border regions, external stimuli, central-regional relations, and the quality of regional government roles (Kuznetsov, 2013). It is crucial to consider these factors before creating programs: alignment with overall government priorities, expected benefits and other impacts, available resources (including financial, human, and political will), legal components (sufficient legal basis for processing), internal performance legacy (performance track record of involved government agencies), and external performance legacy (performance track record and

motivation of foreign partners involved). Therefore, paradiplomacy's role in foreign relations is vital for accelerating international activities (Tavares, 2016). The following outlines the types of paradiplomacy practiced in Indonesia:

Table 1.1 Categorization of Paradiplomacy in Indonesia

No	Type/Indicator	Isolative	Conservative	Progressive
1	Foreign Policy	It's at the central level	It's at the central level	It's at the central level
2	Diplomatic role	There is no authority for foreign cooperation initiatives but assignments from the center	There are foreign cooperation initiatives but they are controlled by the center	There is an authority for foreign cooperation initiatives that can be implemented by paradiplomacy
3	Representative offices abroad	Only available at the central government representative office	There is only a representative office of the central government	Local governments with certain criteria may open representative offices
4	Preparation of cooperation documents with foreign parties	Through the mandate of the <i>Full power</i> center	Through the mandate of the <i>Full power</i> center	It does not need a mandate but is coordinating

Source: (Mukti, 2020)

Paradiplomacy is a form of diplomacy aimed at representing the interests of cities (regions) at the international or regional level, aligning with national interests. Many experts conclude that city diplomacy refers to the role of city governments in foreign relations. City diplomacy is a type of diplomacy that aims to bring the interests of cities (regions) to the international or regional stage, in line with national interests (Fathun, 2022).

Concept Paradiplomacy in Australia

The concept of paradiplomacy was first applied in Australia when the country granted independence to its colonies, allowing them to manage their own territories. This was reflected in the formation of the Commonwealth Constitution of Australia, which united six colonies into a single nation. In 1897, a federal convention was held in Hobart, resulting in a significant decision::

1. The states would join to form a federal nation.
2. The government structure would follow the British system.
3. The federation would be named the Commonwealth of Australia.
4. The Commonwealth of Australia officially came into existence on January 1, 1901.

The formation of the Commonwealth of Australia marked the significance of sub-national government independence in managing their territories during the nation's establishment process. Consequently, the division of powers between state governments and the federal government became highly significant within Australia's constitutional framework.

Australia divides the types of relations between sub-national governments into four levels of international cooperation, namely informal relations, cooperation agreements, Friendship City, and Sister City. In 2000, 130 countries were involved in 3,000 sister city collaborations. Australian local governments have been involved in 392 international collaborations with overseas administrative regions or sub-regions. Australia has established relations between regional governments with 47 countries, with 70% of cooperative activities carried out by the five main countries, namely Japan, China, the United States, Italy and Timor Leste. Australia is one of the countries that provides considerable freedom to local governments to engage in overseas activities. This is reflected in the Australian Constitution, especially Article 51 paragraph XXIX and Article 52 paragraphs I, ii, iii which give exclusive authority to parliament to carry out cross-border activities. Apart from that, there is a State Local Government Act in 1989, which is the basis for local governments to play their role in maintaining peace, order and good governance both at home and abroad, he said. In the legal framework of the Australian Constitution, the principle

of freedom to carry out activities across national borders is also explained in the Senate Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs in Chapters 7 & 8 which states,

“The Committee recommends that the Australian Government explore opportunities for greater and more effective collaboration and coordination with Australian capital city councils in promoting public diplomacy.... The Contribution that government departments and councils such as City of Melbourne make to project a positive image of Australia overseas. Their Activity inform overseas audiences about various aspects of Australia and establish strong links with particular organizations or group overseas. The Committee is of the view, however, that there is potential for these individual efforts to connect better with one another and to make an ever greater contribution to Australia’s public diplomacy.”

This is enough to strengthen the reason why Australia is very actively involved in international cooperation activities. Of the 556 Australian council members, at least 161 council members have participated in 392 international collaborations with sub-national governments abroad, as described in the following table.

Region	Number of council members involved	Total number of Council members	Percentage of council members	Percentage of council members nationally	Number of partnerships	National percentage
New South Wales	62	152	40.8%	38.5%	162	41.3%
Victoria	42	79	53.2%	26.1%	83	21.2%
Queensland	21	73	28.8%	13.0%	68	17.3%
West Australia	17	139	12.2%	10.6%	43	11.0%
South Australia	11	68	16.2%	6.8%	20	5.1%
Tasmania	6	29	20.7%	3.7%	9	2.3%
North Region	2	16	12.5%	1.2%	7	1.8%
Total National	161	556	29.0%	100%	392	100%

Source: Australian Centre of Excellence for Local Government. 2015. Sister City and International Alliances: Can and Should Australian Local Government Play an Expanded Role. ACELG: Sydney. Page 33.

In carrying out paradiplomacy practices as proposed by Keating, Australia must consider subnational governments such as economic, cultural and political aspects. According to Ravenhill, there has been a change in Australia's overseas activities, with regional diversity indirectly increasing costs. As costs increase, this puts pressure on the budget. As a result, in the 1990s, Australian states began to withdraw from some of their international activities in favor of increasing cooperation among themselves and with Commonwealth governments. Since Australia implemented paradiplomacy practices, there have been changes in Australia's overseas activities, including the addition of representatives from each state in overseas cities, for example the addition of 3 New South Wales state staff in Tokyo & Queensland in London as many as 3 staff. 8 staff. With changes and additional staff representatives, there is a significant increase in potential to strengthen communication, investment, trade networks and resolve crises that occur. Population, interest and tourist attraction factors are the main considerations for each state to be able to place its representatives in the country receiving the representatives. In Australia, there are at least 30 sister partnerships between states, mostly in the Indo-Pacific region. In addition, Australia also has hundreds of strong sister city partnerships, including 90 partnerships with China and 90 partnerships with other countries. The process of forming these partnerships reflects the dynamics of a government environment where such interactions have been ongoing for a long time.

Research methods

This research uses a qualitative approach. This research uses a comparative case study between DKI Jakarta (Indonesia and New South Wales (Australia). This research uses secondary data obtained through journals, books, documents, the internet and other relevant sources. In addition, primary data is obtained from

interviews with DKI Jakarta Foreign Cooperation Bureau Data analysis technique uses a tracking process

Result and Discussions

1. Marine Tourism in the Thousand Islands of DKI Jakarta

Indonesia is an area consisting of a cluster of islands that are characteristic of an archipelagic country. The ideology owned by Indonesia is based on Pancasila as the basis of the Indonesian state. The diversity of the archipelago also makes Indonesia a region where its fauna and flora life breeds well and grows prosperously on Indonesian soil. Indonesia has a capital city located in the DKI Jakarta area which is the center of the city, life, and central government of Indonesia. Jakarta as the capital of Indonesia does not rule out the possibility that the Jakarta area is also surrounded by marine diversity and a very abundant marine ecosystem can be found in Jakarta. As the heart of the center of the country, making Jakarta a major destination for local and international tourists to set foot in the city of Jakarta.

A thousand islands are a destination that is eager to be visited by domestic and foreign people even though the distance is very far from the city center. The long long-distance travel becomes a satisfaction in itself for tourists who are tired on the trip and then presented with a very amazing view of the ocean. As a sister city, the natural scenery of the thousand islands has similarities in terms of the beauty of the beach and also marine life.

The tourism sector has a role and participation in the Indonesian economy, especially in Regional Native Income which also contributes to improving welfare for the surrounding communities by opening up jobs and increasing income (Remi et al., 2017). One type of tourism sector that has potential and opportunities in Indonesia is nautical tourism. In its development, it requires support and targeted strategies in the form of government policies, development programs, and activities, budgets from the government, and the participation of the surrounding community in preserving and maintaining regional patterns and characteristics.

Reporting to the Sindonews.com page (2021), marine tourism in the Thousand Islands consists of 6 locations, namely, Pramuka Island, Tidung Island,

Pari Island, Hope Island, Tiger Island, and Putri Island. The six locations offer marine experiences consisting of *diving* and *snorkeling* activities, education and ecotourism in mangrove conservation areas, as well as water sports. The development of marine tourism that has occurred in the past few years can be said to be quite good by covering the institutional, ecological, economic, and social sectors. Research on the development of marine tourism has been carried out by Neksidin, Fachrudin & Kristi resulted in a statement that development from the institutional aspect is still lacking and needs to be improved, while the ecological aspect is preserved, the impact on social and economic for the community has also increased. In the period 2014-2016, a similar study was conducted by Sihotang, Sulardiono & Purwanti (2017), with the conclusion that the development of tourism was in increasing the number of visitors and causing a good impact on job creation and community socialization.

The infrastructure available at marine tourism sites in the Thousand Islands includes three attributes, namely market facilities and infrastructure, health facilities and infrastructure, and the availability of signs in tourist areas. Other attributes include the availability of roads, electricity, lodging, public toilets and landfills (Neksidin et al., 2021). Tourism in the Thousand Islands now has comfortable facilities for visitors and is organized. This happens because of the infrastructure development in each KPSN which is planned for road area arrangement, water supply, waste management, sanitation and repairs for residents' homes whose development has been made a plan by the Regional Infrastructure Development Agency (Ministry of PUPR, 2022). Meanwhile, the research conducted by Adityayoga (Adityayoga, 2018) classifies the facilities in the Thousand Islands along with the location and information about the conditions and can be seen in the table as follows:

Table 1.2 Facilities in the Thousand Islands DKI Jakarta

Facilities	Kind	Location	Information
Infrastructure	Road	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope	Conblock
	Electricity		24 Hours (PLN)
	Clean Water		Groundwater
	Communication network		Restricted Networking
Public facilities	Open Space	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope	No tempat sitting and trash can available
	Hawker Center		No clear zoning
	Hospital	P. Scout	
	Bank/ATM	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Coconut	Bank DKI
	Public Toilets	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope, P. Onrust	Limited hygiene is poorly maintained
	Shopping Center	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari	Managed by the community, poor quality

(Adityayoga, 2018

Table 1.3 Facilities in the Thousand Islands DKI Jakarta

Facilities	Kind	Location	Information
Recreation Facilities	Resource Centre	P. Scout	
	Tool Rental	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope	Snorkeling, bicycle and diving equipment rental
	Watersport	P. Tidung, P. Pari	Banana boat, canoe, jet ski
Private Facilities	Lodging	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope	Homestay or guesthouse
	Catering	P. Tidung, P. Scout, P. Pari, P. Hope	Surrounding communities

Adityayoga, 2018

As an effort to increase interest and further development of marine tourism in the Thousand Islands, *branding* or ownership of a type of product or service is carried out that distinguishes it from similar products. *Enjoy Jakarta* is a big chart that houses the form of tourism activities in Jakarta, including marine tourism, promotions that are carried out are mapped with attractions, levels of attraction, infrastructure, image, to social media (Adityayoga, 2018). Marine tourism in the thousand islands has various types of choices that can be enjoyed by visitors with

sustainable natural conditions which ultimately cause conservation attractions, but there need to be improvements in terms of infrastructure, cleanliness, and accessibility of visitors so that the image of marine tourism of the Thousand Islands can be better and attract visitors to publish it on their respective social media pages. Meanwhile, *branding* promotion in the form of the publication of posters, images, and videos is also carried out to reach more *audiences*. *Branding* is also carried out through the pulauseribu.co.id *website* page which contains images along with important information needed such as general explanations, activities that can be done, vacation packages that can be ordered, the latest news, and admin contacts to answer questions that have not been explained on the page. Here are some examples of islands that are marine tourism destinations in the Thousand Islands:

Picture 1.1 The. iThousand Islands DKI Jakarta



Source: pulauseribu.co.id

At the end of last year, lodging in the form of *homestays* and guest houses was limited to 25-50% capacity, this is a result of the post-Covid-19 recovery, visitors who came were asked to screen and scan QR Peduli Lindungi (Azzahra, 2021). The latest data on visits to the Thousand Islands is reported from the kompas.com page (2022), namely, as many as 46,000 tourists who vacation and enjoy entertainment in the Thousand Islands are included in marine tourism. Dominated by local tourists, 1.3% of this number are foreign tourists, which is about

600 tourists. The surge in tourists occurs during national holidays to commemorate the holiday.

The income generated from the Thousand Islands tourism can be destinas through the prices listed on Laman pulauseribu.co.id. From the information obtained, it can be averaged that for a marine tourism vacation in the Thousand Islands, one person must have a *budget* of around eight hundred thousand rupiahs, that way, at the peak of the surge in visitors, the income earned is 36,800,000,000 or 36.8 billion. This is still in the form of a rough estimate and income that is allegedly received by regional institutions, not including other costs such as snack fees, rent, and souvenir purchases received by the community.

Marine tourism in the Thousand Islands of DKI Jakarta is one of the tourism sectors that has the opportunity and potential to continue to develop so that it can become an alternative tourist attraction while advancing the regional economy. The developments carried out can be launched in terms of infrastructure, accessibility, and imagery formed from comfort and cleanliness so that tourists can be interested in visiting and generate greater income.

2. Marine Tourism in New South Wales, Australia

The development of technology and information has two opportunities that can be felt by its users, namely positive and negative opportunities. These two things cannot be separated because they will affect the condition of the information in the future. Advances in information and technology do not rule out the possibility that it can be used as a medium to promote tourism products and destinations carried out by countries in the world, namely Indonesia and Australia. The two countries have similarities in terms of tourism, in this paper raises tourism destinations in Indonesia, especially in DKI Jakarta and Australia located in New South Wales. In this case, the tourism category is proposed as a reference in comparison and also the similarities assessed in the factors of opportunity and challenge as a result of the sister city cooperation between Indonesia and New South Wales.

New South Wales is one of the states of Australia, as well as the capital of Sydney. The New South Wales region also occupies the highest level of settled and active communities in Australia. Then the natural wealth owned by New South Wales is also inseparable from the amazing natural scenery, even beautiful beaches

are usually located in the territory of the Australian state. If Jakarta has such amazing marine scenery in the Thousand Islands, then the state of New South Wales also has interesting beach tours.

New South Wales boasts endless golden beaches, and stunning natural wealth and is one of Australia's most famous regions. *New South Wales* is famous for its marine tourism, nautical tourism is defined as activities based in proximity to the marine environment, including land and water-based activities in coastal areas (NSW Government, 2019). Here's a further description of what marine tourism can be experienced in *New South Wales*:

Marine Tourism on the South Coast of New South Wales

In 2017, *the South Coast of New South Wales* visited around 10 million visitors, generating revenues of \$2.6 billion. The *New South Wales* government is targeting to get 14 million visitors by 2030.

a. Shipping sector

The Port of Eden is a prime location of *the South Coast of New South Wales* for large-scale voyages. Between 2017 and 2018, 14 cruise ships operated and generated \$4.6 million. The expansion on the Port of Eden pier will provide the necessary infrastructure to serve further growth. Port Kembla from 2017 to 2018 also operated two cruise ships.

b. Leisure boats and charters

Leisure and charter boats are provided for small-scale tour needs, which make it easier for tourists to watch whales and dolphins, dive, riverboats, and *houseboats*.

c. Nature tourism

There are a variety of interesting natural attractions on the *South Coast of New South Wales*, such as: Huskisson, *Jervis Bay*, Booderee national park, Montague island and the *Sapphire Coast's Killer Whale Trail* show.

d. Beach

There are several beautiful beaches located in the *South Coast of New South Wales*, such as Greenfield Beach, Hyams Beach, Myrtle Beach, 1080 Beach, and Nelson Beach.

e. Fishing excursions

Sea fishing is a visitor activity on the popular *South South Coast of New South Wales* . Visitors can fish independently or in groups. In addition, fishing is also provided on the river.

f. Arts and culture

Visitors can learn about indigenous Australian cultures such as Aboriginal culture, and accessible cultural exhibitions such as Munyunga Waraga Dhugan – *Wreck Bay*, Bingi Dreaming trail, Bundian Road, Coombe Nulunga Cultural Trail, and Ngaran Ngaran Culture exhibition tours. Contemporary art is based on the heritage of coal mining, gold mining, whaling, and sailing; and performances by famous artists such as Lloyd Rees, Sydney Nolan, and Arthur Boyd in Bundanon.

g. Sports and adventure

The South Coast offers a variety of sports and adventure options for visitors including; surfing, windsurfing, kayaking, diving and snorkeling, seaplanes, paddle boarding, mountain biking, and skydiving. *Bald Hill* at *Stanwell Park* is one of the best beaches hang-glider locations in the world.

h. Culinary

An assortment of food and drink options along the *South Coast of New South Wales*, including in Berry, Gerroa, Merimbula, Moruya, Milton, Nowra and Ulladulla. Visitors can enjoy wine in the Shoalhaven region, fresh seafood, produce and other snacks.

i. Pedestrian and cyclist trails

New South Wales' south coast is a welcoming place for pedestrians and cyclists on long-distance trails such as in the *Murramarang South Coast*, *Light to Light*, and Minnamurra areas. (NSW Government, 2019)

Marine Infrastructure

New South Wales has significant marine infrastructure and assets along 300km of coastline. The Government of *New South Wales* has and continues to invest heavily in the delivery of boating and maritime infrastructure along the coast through programs such as *NSW Boating Now*, and *The Better Boating Program*. The large geographical scale in the southern part of New South Wales and the lower

population density make the southern tourism asset base of *New South Wales* more dispersed. Here are the opportunities that exist on the South Coast including:

a. Bermagui

Bermagui is a town on the south coast of *New South Wales*, Australia. The city offers many high-standard dining options, including fresh fish outlets. Ongoing care will support long-term development.

b. Wollongong

Wollongong is the third largest city in the state of New South Wales, the *New South Wales* government is preparing a *master plan* for the development of the Port's leisure and tourism potential. There is an opportunity to improve facilities at *Port Kembla* to enable increased cruise visits.

c. Shellharbour Marina

Shellharbour Marina is a destination for tourists who love Australia's seaside lifestyle. Shellharbour Marina, which includes 145 berths, has now been completed and welcomes tourists to visit their berths. Shellharbour Marina has so much to offer including harbourside eateries and taverns, a vibrant city centre, luxury apartment dwellings, and hotels.

d. Merimbula

Merimbula is a town on Lake Merimbula, located on the *Sapphire Coast* in New South Wales, through the New *South Wales* government's *CBD Landscape Master* plan initiative will make Merimbula a tourist and entertainment spot.

e. Port of Eden

An extension of the pier is underway and wave dampers are proposed at Snug Cove. Eden's unique status as a cruise port provides a special visitor demand for harbourside activities, offering significant opportunities to enhance the seaside and harbor precincts to unlock the city's tourism potential.

f. Kiama

Kiama is a small town located 120 kilometers south of Sydney in the southern coastal area of *New South Wales*, Australia. Its population is about

20,000 people. Kiama is known as a neat city that has beautiful beaches. The Government of *New South Wales* is seeking to improve its waterfront, harbor, and beyond for its tourism development in Nowra River Area

The Government of *New South Wales* is developing a *master* plan to support the development of the Nowra River Basin. The focus of development is on the marina, oyster bar and play area.

g. Huskisson Wharf

Access to boating in this region found several obstacles considering the limited environmental conditions of siltation and tides. Floating pontoons and anchors will be a potential solution for tourists to comfortably boat in the Huskisson Wharf region.

h. Ulladulla

Ulladulla is a coastal town in New South Wales, The ongoing redevelopment of the harbor is important for the economic growth of the area. There is significant scope to increase the recreational and tourism potential of the port area.

i. Batemans Bay

Batemans Bay is a major visitor center on the South Coast equipped with marine park tourism potential. With the realignment of the Batemans Bay Bridge, there is an opportunity to further activate the seaside area.

j. *Jervis Bay*

Jervis Bay is a 102-square-kilometer bay and ocean village on the south coast of *New South Wales*, Australia, which is said to have the whitest sand in the world. *Jervis Bay* provides a prominent environment for nature-based tourism activities. (NSW Government, 2019)

The following is attached an infographic image of the South Coast Region of New South Wales as a marine tourism destination:

Picture 1.2 Infographic New South Wales South Coast Region as a marine tourism destination



Source : New South Wales : South Coast Marine Tourism Strategy 2019

Most visitors to *the South Coast of New South Wales* are overnight domestic travelers (38%), or day trip visitors (60%), with few international visitors staying overnight (2%). Domestic overnight visitors stand out more than domestic day visitors and international visitors spending the night in the south, accounting for 52% of all domestic visitors in the Shoalhaven, Eurobodalla, and Bega Valley areas. Domestic day visitors continue to dominate visits to the region, especially in Kiama, Wollongong, and Shellharbour (75% of all visitors) Wollongong accounts for the largest proportion of visitors in the region (34%) while Shoalhaven attracts the most spending (27%). (NSW Government, 2019)

Picture 1. 3. Tourism Expenses and Visits, including international overnight visitors, domestic overnights, and domestic day trips



Source : *New South Wales : South Coast Marine Tourism Strategy 2019*

The Power of the South Coast of New South Wales

- a. The region's pristine coastal environment is its greatest strength. State Governments and local partners are committed to protecting and enhancing these assets and Local Governments are required to establish coastal management plans through the Coastal Management Act.
 - b. Marine tourism, national parks, and state forests located close to the coast provide a variety of nature-based activities, including bushwalking, swimming, and snorkeling.
 - c. The South Coast of *New South Wales* is a sought-after destination for spotting wildlife – whales, dolphins, seals, and birds.
 - d. Marine excursions are offered on the family-friendly south coast of *New South Wales*.
 - e. Easy and close access to tourist-bustling areas such as Canberra, Greater Sydney, and the Western Sydney growth corridor. (NSW Government, 2019)
- a. Although the beach area is used as a tourist attraction, the local government needs to keep the beach clean so that it is not polluted.
 - b. Ensuring smooth cooperation with various stakeholders and jurisdictions in the marine and tourism environment. (NSW Government, 2019)

One example is Byron Bay City. In the City of Byron Bay, which is included in the territory of New South Wales, it is an area located on the east side of the New South Wales region. Within Byron Bay City also has a long coastline and offers amazing views. Moreover, there is Byron Bay Beach which is also the main destination that local and foreign tourists really want to visit.

Byron Bay, located in northeastern New South Wales, Australia, is a popular coastal paradise with sand, sun, and tranquility, making Byron Bay a relaxing tourist spot and a target for travelers arriving in the New South Wales region to occupy it as a resting place and yoga aimed at everyone,

Whether it is ordinary tourists or Hollywood celebrities. Byron Bay provides a lighthouse that can be used as a destination for tourists to enjoy the sunset with loved ones, and there are accommodations and luxurious culinary delights that are very unfortunate if you don't try them when visiting the coastal area. In addition, Byron Bay is a tourist attraction that can be visited at any time without being limited by the changing seasons that are increasingly occurring in New South Wales. So every tourist who arrives will still be able to feast their eyes on the refreshing scenic and weather conditions by doing a variety of activities to fill their free time on the Byron Bay coastline. Paradiplomation cooperation between domestic and foreign tourists so that the income of the two countries will increase with each other. Not only tourist attractions, although paradiplomacy activities carried out by Jakarta and New South Wales are in the field of tourism, this will also have an impact on the economic field that increases the country's foreign exchange,

On the other hand, the characteristics possessed by New South Wales are inseparable from the wealth of tourism that is so attractive and offered by the Australian state. New South Wales is a state in Australia and is also a city with a very high population like the state of Sydney. In addition, New South Wales has one of the most legendary tourist attractions, namely, the Sydney Opera House, Bondi Beach, Byron Bay Beach, Palm Beach, to the Royal National Park. So that New South Wales is one of the states that local and foreign tourists want to visit with charming natural beauty. Therefore, after knowing the location of the two

sister city countries in the aspect of tourism, which is a very meaningful local and international tourist destination. So that an opportunity and also a challenge arises from sister city cooperation activities between the Thousand Islands located in Indonesia and New South Wales which is in the territory of Australia.

3. Opportunities and Challenges of Marine Tourism Cooperation Between DKI Jakarta and New South Wales

3.1 Challenges

Sister city cooperation is an attempt to cooperate with two cities in different countries to establish a relationship of familiarity between the two countries involved and establish cultural relations and social contacts between residents. The cities that are objects in sister city cooperation are cities that have similar circumstances, be it in terms of geography, demographics, and internal problems that are owned. Issues that are usually the field of sister city cooperation include the economy, trade, investment, industry, and tourism.

The stages for establishing sister city cooperation are the introduction of the potential of the two cities, signing a letter of intent, requesting the approval of the regional parliament, submitting a request for facilities to the central government, making a draft MoU and then ending with the implementation of cooperation. Indonesia itself is one of the countries that has established sister city cooperation with many countries. Indonesia is a country that focuses on sister city cooperation in the economic field, followed by education and culture.

Regulations regarding sister cities in Indonesia are regulated in Indonesia, the rules related to sister cities are regulated in the circular letter of the Minister of Home Affairs No. 193/1652/PUOD on April 26, 1993 which regulates the procedures for establishing cooperative relations. The tourism nautical cooperation relationship between the Thousand Islands of DKI Jakarta and New South Wales Australia is one of the most potential sister city cooperation. This is based on the similar geographical conditions of the two cities. New South Wales is a city that has a varied area with beaches, snowy mountains, forests, so this city has the

potential to be used as a tourism object. This sister city work is a form of paradiplomacy activities through city diplomacy.

The involvement of municipal or district governments in the international network of global politics is increasingly massive. Although nation-states retain their strength and resources to shape the global agenda, cities are increasingly standing out on the world stage as powerful new actors. A municipal diplomacy is an important tool of municipal governments not only to maintain the support of citizens by advancing their global interests but also to attract global investment and talent, increase international visibility and intervene in the global flow of international relations. (Acuto, 2013) (Lord, 2000) D urban exploration is a renewed enthusiasm to jointly address common urban challenges and the availability of network channels should be seen as a positive development. The great potential of different types of city networks and strategic alliances lies in their dynamic and innovative modes of operation. However, they also risk becoming increasingly competitive, especially regarding territorial overload (Rayner, 2016) .

In connection with the sister city cooperation between DKI Jakarta and New South Wales as a form of city diplomacy activities as a form of paradiplomacy activities, of course there are a number of opportunities and challenges that surround the two cities, namely challenges from the New South Wales side, namely

- a. Many other coastal destinations offer similar selling points; The region needs to build differentiation to compete. By strengthening adequate beach facilities and nature-based tourism offerings.
- b. The rate of tourist visits has increased dramatically during the long holiday period, creating overcrowding that leads to a lack of lodging and hotels.
- c. Lack of luxury and eco-friendly accommodation to meet the expectations of the visitor market.
- d. Popular visitor activities (beach, walking, nature-based) tend to have a low contribution to regional income
- e. The most attractive and sensitive neighborhoods of the area (National Parks and Marine Parks) are becoming popular destinations for visitors and tourism

development. Which can threaten its sustainability if it is not accompanied by intensive care (NSW Government, 2019).

Looking at the quality of nautical governance in New South Wales Australia, it seems that DKI Jakarta must improve and increase cooperation between regions. This means that there are many things that Jakarta must learn from New South Wales to be able to develop better, especially the Thousand Islands area. The challenges from the DKI Jakarta side, especially the Thousand Islands, are:

1. The challenge of infrastructure support, seeing the data above that the quality and availability of infrastructure in the Thousand Islands are still not optimal. The implications will affect the taste of marine tourism in the region. For example, the availability of clean water only relies on groundwater. In modern tourism governance, the quality and quantity of water available must be integrated, for example, a public container is needed that can distribute the entire water based on modern technology. Then, in terms of communication networks, it is still limited, meaning that the quality of the existing network in the region must have a fast connection capacity. Because the character of marine tourism visitors, especially foreign tourists, always prioritizes a fast internet network. Because their tendency is always to update with the activities they do.

Then another issue is the issue of cleanliness and public facilities. Foreign tourists are very concerned with public facilities because the availability of seats and garbage dumps shows the culture of a place. The more availability of public facilities related to cleanliness, the more foreign tourists will like it. Moreover, there are certain seats provided for photo spots, creating content, and so on. Moreover, in the area, Nusantara culinary zoning is made so that it can add to the lively visitors to visit. Indonesia already has very famous culinary such as Rendang, Soto Betawi, Kerak Telor, Gado-Gado, and some other culinary snacks that can also be part of gastrodiplomation as branding the archipelago.

Then another challenge is the availability of lodging facilities that are not aesthetically pleasing and accompanied by traditional shopping facilities.

Coupled with the lack of tourist options it does not seem professional in marine tourism. Therefore, the main key is the development of good infrastructure so that it can attract more foreign tourists, which will certainly increase the original income of the region which is also a source of foreign exchange for the country.

2. The next challenge is the ability to manage human resources. Why is this important because resources are the key to managing marine tourism? The role of human resources is related to managerial governance, marketing, maintenance, and improvement of tourism. Good human resources must be equipped with knowledge skills about good governance, technological capabilities, and communication skills. Therefore, the importance of increasing human resources who manage marine tourism in the Thousand Islands must be given knowledge through capacity building either organized by the Provincial Government or by attracting established experts in marine tourism governance. Why capacity building s, because capacity building is knowledge and can be socialized and passed back on to the next generation. So that with good resource capabilities, it will be easy to innovate and create in building and improving marine tourism which will have implications for income and benefits in various aspects of life.
3. The next challenge is the integration of information technology. In this section, some stakeholders must be able to adopt a digital economy transformation model or digital economy tourism. This relates to the use of information technology as part of governance e-government and e-diplomacy. E-government means that the role of digital stakeholders can make innovations and promotional creativity through new media platforms such as Twitter, Instagram, tik tok, Facebook, and others media. Currently, the government has a website as an initial information medium to introduce marine tourism to the public. But according to the author, this is only e government not yet e diplomacy. Because diplomacy can make it easier for young people, especially foreign tourists, to know DKI Jakarta, especially the Thousand Islands. The onslaught of promotion through social media will attract an influx of foreign investment and visitors to earn the country's

foreign exchange (Fan, 2016). Then the hope is that using social media as an instrument e diplomacy will facilitate interaction between actors, be it government or the public. Bholá and Holmes said that when the world is faced with digital diplomacy, two things must be done, namely policy change and institutional adaptation. From these arguments, social media can be part of promotional media, information media, and flexible interactions. This policy reform and institutional adaptation are indispensable to arriving at the use of e diplomacy (Holmes, 2015).

4. The next challenge is the ability of stakeholders related to utilizing the pattern of urban diplomacy cooperation as a paradiplomacy activity to become micro power sister island diplomacy. Why is this important because the city diplomacy cooperation between DKI Jakarta and New South Wales is only paying for middle diplomacy cooperation? Because above the cooperation, there is the cooperation of Indonesia and Australia. But the most important thing is micro-power level cooperation because the most concrete implementation of cooperation is at the smallest level. In this case, it is the cooperation between nautical islands that have the same tendency as twin islands. With this similarity, it can add to the quality of cooperation between countries, between regions, and between sub-divisions in the regions. The Thousand Islands has several islands such as Tidung Island, Putri Island, and others while in New South Wales it has Bondi Beach, Byron Bay Beach, and Palm Beach. This cooperation is important as a form of implementation of city diplomacy. Theoretically, Urban diplomacy is included in theorizing about city diplomacy the study of "paradiplomation". Paradiplomacy (Melisen, 2007) (Carlesnaes, 2013) begins with "para-", which means parallel to and diverse with current international relations actors. As has been pointed out by (Soldatos, 1990) (Van der Pluijm, 2007)

There are two things when talking about a global city, namely **a city is** a place where it should be a safe and metropolis place to live, a place to do business, and a place of community. In addition, **a city as an actor** is expected to be able to map its potential to be competitive and create branding so that it can be known that it can contribute to local development. National and

international (Acuto, 2013). Why is the involvement of cities important in foreign relations, because a) the phenomenon of globalization makes interactions even more complex. As a result, Acuto referred to it as international bias. This situation will bring the phenomenon of urbanization of people moving from villages to cities. Because the city promises prosperity, a new culture, and a new community. Then b) the phenomenon of displacement will create a Relationship according to Acuto. This relationship will determine the regions involved in various situations (Acuto, 2013) . In the involvement of paradiplomacy actions as actors, of course, they collaborate in various fields that suit their needs

The role of urban location by paradiplomacy in foreign relations is very important. City automation is a form of diplomacy that aims to bring the interests of the city (region) at the international or regional level in line with the interests of the state. Surely this city diplomacy aims to become an influential global city Many experts conclude that municipal diplomacy refers to the role of municipal governments in foreign relations (Kuznetsov, 2013). Municipal diplomacy cooperation is a model of future cooperation to bring the micro-interests of city citizens at the global level (Grandi, 2020) . Even hyperglobalist thinkers say that regions that have the ability of resources, capital flows, and technology should be able to compete with the nation-state. Regions can widen their interests by utilizing sub-national actors such as NGOs to achieve regional interests in international targets. (Aldecoa, 2013)

Thus, through the sister city cooperation, which was downgraded to Micro Sister Island cooperation, it will become a branding and model in international cooperation in the future. This branding will be the city's soft power for foreign relations. Thus, urban soft power refers to the brand, attractiveness, and reputation that cities build within a global community (Chillón 2018). Cities use this power to (Van der Pluijm, 2007) influence the global agenda in policies that are important to the prosperity, security, and well-being of their citizens. This strength lies in the representative dimension of city diplomacy, or other words city branding. City imaging usually refers to the strategic efforts of various stakeholders to market a city "to attract

incoming investment, customers for its export products, or visitors for its tourism industry." (Deganutti, 2017) Therefore, this collaboration is very important to learn from each other's strengths and synergize in creating sustainable development.

3.2 Challenges

In addition to a number of challenges that may be faced by each region, especially DKI Jakarta in developing the Thousand Islands, according to the author, there are also a number of good or opportunities that have the potential to be obtained by both parties, namely:

1. Through sister city cooperation developed through sister island diplomacy, it will have the potential to open up opportunities for investment cooperation. This means that New South Wales in this case as a representation of Australia has the opportunity to become a donor or investor in developing the Thousand Islands like the development in Australia. From the Indonesian side, it has the opportunity to add Indonesian tourists who visit Australia, especially the New South Wales region.
2. There is a transfer of knowledge and transfer technology in the development of regional governance, especially in the Thousand Islands area in DKI Jakarta. This will be a great advantage and opportunity for DKI Jakarta to be more professional, and comprehensive in managing marine tourism as a source of income for the country's watershed and foreign exchange. This means that through the transfer of knowledge and technology, this is a form of building the capacity of quality human resources to make Thousand Islands tourism one of the branding that can be popular as is done by Australia through New South Wales.
3. Increasing close relations between levels of actors ranging from countries, namely Australia and Indonesia in various fields, continued in the form of paradiplomation, namely New South Wales and DKI Jakarta as well as sister islands between the Thousand Islands and several islands in New South Wales such as Bondi Beach, Byron Bay Beach. This concept was later the author called micro Power Sister Cities.

Therefore, sister-city cooperation both at the city level and at the island level will be very important to create branding for each region as a form of commitment to creating sustainable development in the field of tourism. Tourism is a very potential field between the two parties and it is time for the cooperation to be carried out very seriously so that it can have implications for the socio-economic life of the surrounding community. And also further strengthen relations between countries and between regions such as twin cities and twin islands.

Conclusion

Based on the results of the analysis above, the author found that tourism is one of the main destinations in realizing sustainable international cooperation. Tourism is a potential area that can be managed to maximize regional income as well as state revenue. Nautical tourism is a form of tourist destination in the modern era that is much loved to visit. For this reason, governance and cooperation at both the micro and macro levels are needed.

Australia and Indonesia already cooperate in various fields. One of the very serious collaborations developed is marine

tourism carried out by New South Wales and DKI Jakarta. New South Wales has several potential and beautiful marine tourism destinations to visit as well as DKI Jakarta. Sister city cooperation between New South Wales and DKI Jakarta must be reduced to cooperation between marine destination islands as a commitment of twin islands. Of course, this will greatly attract visitors to each city through the cooperation of paradiplomacy and city diplomacy. Therefore, this collaboration must continue to be developed to get positive value from tourism potential.

However, the great opportunity of DKI Jakarta and New South Wales must continue to learn to fill each other. This is based on collaboration must have challenges, especially DKI Jakarta which is represented by the Thousand Islands. The challenges of infrastructure, human resources, communication technology, and cooperation models will determine how the quality of cooperation can develop better. For this reason, DKI Jakarta has the potential to get opportunities to obtain investment donors, and socialization of capacity building if it learns from tourism

governance in Australia, especially New South Wales. Thus, this collaboration can continue to be coordinated and collaborate to get benefits for the community in their respective regions.

Bibliography

Books

- Acuto, Michele. (2013). *Global Cities , Governance and Diplomacy*. New York: Routledge.
- Aldecoa, M. &. (2013). *Paradiplomacy In Action*. New York: Routledge.
- Carlhaes, Walter et.al. (2013). *International Relations Handbook*. Bandung: Nusamedia.
- Fathun, L. M. (2016). *Transormation of Post-Cold War International Relations Issues in the Era of Globalization*. Yogyakarta: Kosmojoyo Press.
- Grandi, Lorenzo. K. (2020). *City Diplomacy*. Paris School of International Affairs (PSIA) Paris France,,: Palgrave macmillan.
- Holmes, Corneliu BJola. (2015). *Digital Diplmacy*. London: Routledge.
- Kuznetsov, A. S. (2013). *Theory and Practice of Paradiplomacy*. New York: Routledge.
- Lord, C. (2000). *Legitimacy, Democracy and the EU: When Abstract Questions Become Practical Policy Problems*. Brighton: Sussex European Institute.
- Marchetti, R. (2021). *City Diplomacy From City States to Global States*. New York: University Michigan Press.
- Sevin, S. A. (2020). *City Diplomacy Current Trend Future Prospects*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan .
- Soldatos, H. M. (1990). *Federalism and international relations: The role of sub-national units*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Steele, Wendy & Michele Acuto. (2013). *The Pelgrave Macmillan Global City Challanges Debating a Concept, Improving, the Practice*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Tavares, R. (2016). *Paradiplomacy Cities and States as Global Player*. New Yor: Oxford University Press.

Van der Pluijm, R. & Jan Melisen (2007). *City diplomacy: The expanding role of cities in international politics*. Nederland: The Hague: Netherlands Institute of International Relations 'Clingendael.

Journals

Acuto, Michele. (2013). World Politics by Other Means? London, City Diplomacy and the Olympics. *The Hague Journal of Diplomacy*, 8 (3–4): 287–311.

Adityayoga. (2018). Destination Branding Mapping. *Journal of Color Art*, 6, 197–213.

Aryunda, H. (2011). Economic Impact of Island Ecotourism Area Development.

Deganutti, C. D. (2017). Soft power and dark heritage: Multiple potentialities. *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 23(6), 660–674.

Fathun, L. M. (2022). The Role of Paradiplomacy in Indonesia's G20 Presidency: A Case Study of Jakarta City Diplomacy in Urban 20. *Indonesia Perspectives*, 57-78.

Fathun, L. M. (2021). Paradiplomacy in Creating Regional Competitiveness: Case Study of Jember Regency. *Indonesian Perspective*, 166-186.

Fathun, L. M. (2016). Paradiplomation Towards a World City: A Case Study of the Makassar City Government. *Indonesian Perspective*, 71-94.

Neksidin, Fahrudin, A., & Krisanti, M. (2021). Sustainability of Marine Tourism Management on Pari Island, Thousand Islands Regency. *Indonesian Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 26(2), 284–291. <https://doi.org/10.18343/jipi.26.2.284>

Rayner, M. A. (2016). City networks: Breaking gridlocks or forging (new) lock-ins?. *International Affairs*, 92(5), 1147–1166.

One thousand. *Journal of Urban and Regional Planning*, 22(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.5614/jpwk.2011.22.1.1>

Remi, S. S., Waluyo, D. S., & Muljarjadi, B. (2017). The Role of Tourism in The Development of Regional Economy: Case Study of The Special Capital Region of Jakarta Province. *AFEBI Economic and Finance Review (AEFR)*, 02(01).

Sihotang, S. P., Sulardiono, B., & Purwanti, F. (2017). *Evaluation of the Development of Marine Tourism on Tidung Besar Island, Thousand Islands*. 6, 302–310.

Internet

Azzahra, T. A. (2021). *Thousand Islands Tourism Reopened, Visitor Capacity 25%*. SecondsNews. <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5778136/wisata-kepulauan-seribu-kembali-dibuka-kapasitas-pengunjung-25>

Kanariyati, P. N. (2021). *6 Marine Tourism in the Thousand Islands is cool Abis*. Sindonews.Com. <https://metro.sindonews.com/read/599265/171/6-tempat-wisata-bahari-di-kepulauan-seribu-yang-keren-habis>

Ministry of PUPR. (2022). *Tourism to the Thousand Islands, Now More Comfortable and Tidy*. Pu.Go.Id. <https://pu.go.id/berita/wisata-ke-kepulauan-seribu-kini-semakin-nyaman-dan-rapi>.

Purnamasari, D. M. (2022). *46,000 Tourists Visit Thousand Islands During Eid Holidays, Tidung Island Love Bridge Is A Favorite*. Kompas.Com. <https://megapolitan.kompas.com/read/2022/05/10/13203731/46000-wisatawan-kunjungi-kepulauan-seribu-selama-libur-lebaran-jembatan>.

NSW Government. (2019). *NEW SOUTH WALES SOUTH COAST : Marine Tourism Strategy*. <https://www.nsw.gov.au/regional-nsw/20-year-vision-for-nsw-south-coast-marine-tourism>

<https://www.australia.com/id-id/places/new-south-wales.html>

<https://jakbarkota.bps.go.id/indikator/23/117/1/indikator-kemiskinan.html>